MINUTES OF THE
MACOMB COUNTY ETHICS BOARD

Wednesday, May 17, 2017

A meeting of the Macomb County Ethics Board was held Wednesday, May 17, 2017, at 8:45 a.m., in the 9th Floor Committee Room of the Macomb County Administration Building, One South Main Street, Mount Clemens, Michigan.

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Amboyer called the meeting to order at 8:47 a.m.

ROLL CALL

The following Members were present:

Dr. Donald Amboyer, Paddy Laske and Dorie Vazquez-Nolan
James McGrail and Brian Gabriel – Absent and Excused

Michelle LaBelle, Macomb County Finance – Risk & Insurance, prepared/reported the Minutes.

ADOPTION OF AGENDA

MOTION
A motion was made by Dorie Vazquez-Nolan, supported by Paddy Laske, to adopt the Agenda as presented. The Motion Carried.

APPROVE MEETING MINUTES OF APRIL 19, 2017

MOTION
A motion was made by Paddy Laske, supported by Dorie Vazquez-Nolan, to approve the Minutes of April 19, 2017. The Motion Carried.

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Frank Cusumano, Attorney for Karen Spranger; Jackie Ryan, Deputy Register of Deeds; Jerry Witt, UAW Local 412; and Donna Cangemi, AFSCME President 411 addressed the Board regarding Ethics Complaint CO2-2017.
CORRESPONDENCE

A budget matter was discussed concerning Mr. Anthony Marrocco’s 10/15/16 ethics violation in which he was fined $125, but has not been paid. Consequently, the Ethics Board budget is getting debited. The Board will invite the Finance Director to the next meeting.

Mr. Joseph Hunt’s April 4, 2017 written questions were responded to.

A county employee wanted a copy of the current complaints and was advised to file a FOIA.

County Clerk Karen Spranger was sent a letter on April 21, 2017, notifying her of the ethics violation and $100 fine.

Erin Stahl sent a letter to the Board on May 11, 2017, with an amendment request to Complaint C03-2017.

Clerk Spranger’s Attorney, Frank Cusumano, requested an audio copy of the last meeting. Dorie Vazquez-Nolan provided an audio flash drive to Mr. Cusumano.

ETHICS COMPLAINT HEARING (C03-2017)

Case #C02-2017 – Complainant Erin Stahl/Respondent Karen Spranger- Complaint filed on 3/12/17 – concerning Enrolled Ordinance 2016-13 Section 5.1 & 2.1 E. Chair Amboyer stated that decisions will be made on or before May 12, 2017 unless a 30 day extension is needed then June 10, 2017 would be the last day the Board would reach a final decision. This complaint was postponed until today’s meeting.

Chair Amboyer conducted an Oath for Ms. Stahl and asked her to state her allegations.

Ms. Stahl, former Chief Deputy, Register of Deeds, provided her resume and discussed prior employment and Register of Deeds and Clerk responsibilities. Ms. Stahl discussed Ordinance 2.1 and her Ethics Complaint against Macomb County Clerk Karen Spranger.

Chair Amboyer asked Ms. Stahl if she felt she had been retaliated against due to her complaint. Ms. Stahl said she does feel that she was fired due to filing an Ethics complaint. Dorie Vazquez-Nolan asked Ms. Stahl if there was anything additional information which might distinguish her complaint from Complaint #C02-2017 which received a hearing on 4/19/2017. No other information was shared by Ms. Stahl.

MOTION
A motion was made by Dorie Vazquez-Nolan, supported by Paddy Laske, to dismiss Complaint C03-2017 with discussion.
Chair Amboyer stated he hasn’t heard anything new or different from Respondent than what was presented from the previous hearing (C02-2017) on the same issues. He would like to hear more if it is different or more information in this second complaint. The Board can’t rule twice on same issues. Paddy Laske commented that if retaliation is considered, another complaint would need to be filed.

**MOTION**

A motion was made by Dorie Vazquez-Nolan, to dismiss Complaint C03-2017.

A Roll Call Vote was taken as follows: Dorie Vazquez-Nolan – Yes, Paddy Laske – No, Chair Amboyer – No **The Motion Failed.**

Testimony continued from Ms. Stahl.

Chair Amboyer invited the respondent, Clerk Karen Spranger to respond to complaint.

Frank Cusumano, Attorney for Karen Spranger, requested John Schapka, Corporation Counsel to discuss HR policies – under Rules of Procedure 2.5F – policies dated 1-12-17 and 3-12-17 (IT policies). Mr. Schapka said there is a conflict of interest and he can only offer administrative procedure information.

Frank Cusumano said the Rules of Procedure are not complete and since a Procedure is not in place due to the new Ordinance, Karen Spranger does not want to respond.

Chair Amboyer concluded testimony of those present by asking Board Members if they had sufficient information to render a decision today.

**MOTION**

A motion was made by Dorie Vazquez-Nolan, supported by Paddy Laske, to dismiss Complaint #C03-2017 due to no new information, relative to Complaint #C02-2017 which was previously voted upon.

A Roll Call Vote was taken as follows: Dorie Vazquez-Nolan – Yes, Paddy Laske – Yes, Chair Amboyer – Yes **the Motion Carried.**

The Board took a five minute recess and reconvened at 10:10 am.

**ETHIC BOARD UPDATES (WEBPAGE, FORMS, PROCEDURES, BUDGET, ETC.)**

The Board discussed title changes and new photos that need to be updated on the website. Chair Amboyer drafted Complaint and Advisory Opinion Forms which need to be form-fillable for placement on the Ethics Board Website.

**MOTION**

A motion was made by Dorie Vazquez-Nolan, supported by Don Amboyer, to adopt Complaint and Advisory Opinion Forms and request IT to update website. **The Motion Carried.**
Special Meeting Dates were discussed for Rules of Procedure for the New Ordinance. Steve Smigiel, Director of Finance to be invited to the next meeting to discuss the budget and the fine for Mr. Morocco.

ETHICS ONLINE TRAINING INVOICE
An invoice from Syntrie for $2500 is due. Training is discontinued due to the new ordinance. Chair Amboyer to write a letter to Syntrie and submit with the check.

MOTION
A motion was made by Dorie Vazquez-Nolan, supported by Paddy Laske, to pay the Syntrie Invoice for $2500. The Motion Carried.

EXPENSE REIMBURSEMENT

MOTION
A motion was made by Dorie Vazquez-Nolan, supported by Paddy Laske, to reimburse Chair Amboyer for office supplies and postal expenses incurred for the total amount of $166.71. The Motion Carried.

2016 ANNUAL REPORT DRAFT
Chair Amboyer requested Board Members to review the draft prior to submitting at the meeting next month.

RECOMMENDED ORDINANCE ENHANCEMENTS
This will be discussed at the Special Meeting next month. The Board will go through the Charter, Original Ordinance, and the New Ordinance.

OTHER BUSINESS
None

NEXT REGULARLY SCHEDULED MEETING: JUNE 21, 2017 - 8:45 A.M.

ADJOURNMENT MOTION
A motion was made by Dorie Vazquez-Nolan, supported by Paddy Laske, to adjourn the meeting at 10:35 a.m. The Motion Carried.

Approved:

[Signatures]

Donald J. Amboyer, Ph.D., Chairperson

Dorie Vazquez-Nolan, Secretary